



January 11, 2019

Mr. Phillip Francis  
Director of Operations  
Livonia Public Schools  
15125 Farmington Road  
Livonia, MI 48154

RE: Sinking Fund Projects  
Contract Award Recommendation for Athletic Field Improvements – Partial Award  
Stevenson High School / Franklin High School

Dear Mr. Francis:

This letter transmits an update from Plante Moran Cresa (PMC) as it relates to the assignment to assist and advise Livonia Public Schools (LPS) in its selection of Prime Contractors for the Projects listed above. This update represents the mutual efforts of PMC, Foresite Design, Inc., LPS administration and staff (the Team) to present a framework in order to identify, evaluate and recommend Prime Contractor firms for these Projects.

On November 15, 2018, Construction Documents were formally issued and made available. An advertisement for bids was published in a local newspaper and also posted to the required State of Michigan website.

On December 6, 2018, nineteen (19) bid proposals for six (6) bid categories were received for the Projects, and over the next several weeks were reviewed to determine the budget implications. Interviews were conducted on December 20<sup>th</sup> & 21<sup>st</sup>, 2018 and were attended by representatives from Foresite Design, PMC, and LPS. The scope of work, project schedule, manpower requirements, and other particulars regarding the work were reviewed and discussed.

Upon completion of the interviews, and after subsequent clarifications and discussions, the Team is recommending the firms listed in Foresite Design's letter dated January 10, 2019. Please note that the recommended bidder for Proposals A1 and A2 is the second low bidder.

The recommendation is to award five of the six bid categories only. The Team is not recommending award of the scoreboard bid category at this time due to bid costs received and low participation. The Team will revisit the design and scope of this package and will rebid this work at a later date. Please also note that this recommendation does not include the athletic turf work at Stevenson High School and Franklin High School as that work was previously bid and awarded in 2018.

There were a total of four (4) alternates which were bid. This recommendation includes the acceptance of two bid alternates (A-2 and A-4). The other bid alternates (A-1 and A-3) were associated with the scoreboard work and are not applicable to this recommendation. In addition, two of the recommended bidders provided savings associated with a combined bid for both sites. The accepted base bid

alternates total a net add of \$34,400.00. The accepted combined bid savings total a net deduct of <\$40,520.00>.

- Sitework Contractor
  - o Alternate A-2 – Install Foundations, Protective Netting & Posts for Stevenson HS for Lacrosse (Add \$10,800)
  - o Alternate A-4 – Remove & Replace Asphalt Under Stevenson HS Home Grandstands (Add \$23,600)
  - o Combined Bid Savings for Stevenson & Franklin Award (Deduct \$40,000)
- Fencing Contractor
  - o Combined Bid Savings for Stevenson & Franklin Award (Deduct \$520)

Including hard construction of \$2,157,800.00 and construction contingency of \$276,653.00 (8% of Recommended Bidders + Value of Turf for these sites from 2018 award), the total Project award recommendation equals \$2,434,453.00.

For the Prime Contractors, the costs for this work will be detailed in AIA Contract A105 – 2017 Standard Form of Agreement between Owner and Contractor, pending final review and approval of terms by district legal counsel.

The Project Team is available at the Board's convenience to answer any questions regarding bidding, the proposals, interview process, or the recommendation herein. Please direct all questions through me via email at [scott.smith@plantemoran.com](mailto:scott.smith@plantemoran.com).

Sincerely,

PLANTE MORAN CRESA



Scott Smith, LEED AP  
Senior Consultant

Enclosures: Cost Summary  
Foresite Design, Inc. Recommendation Letter  
Bid Tabulation



**ATHLETIC FIELD IMPROVEMENTS - COST SUMMARY**

<b>Building</b>	<b>Hard Construction</b>		
	<b>Budget *</b>	<b>Actual</b>	<b>Variance</b>
Stevenson High School	\$ 1,100,000	\$ 1,161,438	\$ (61,438)
Franklin High School	\$ 1,100,000	\$ 996,362	\$ 103,638
<b>Totals</b>	<b>\$ 2,200,000</b>	<b>\$ 2,157,800</b>	<b>\$ 42,200</b>

<b>Building</b>	<b>Construction Contingency (8%)</b>		
	<b>Budget **</b>	<b>Actual **</b>	<b>Variance</b>
Franklin / Stevenson HS	\$ 294,829	\$ 276,653	\$ 18,176
<b>Totals</b>	<b>\$ 294,829</b>	<b>\$ 276,653</b>	<b>\$ 18,176</b>

<b>Building</b>	<b>Total Project Costs</b>		
	<b>Budget</b>	<b>Actual</b>	<b>Variance</b>
Franklin / Stevenson HS	\$ 2,494,829	\$ 2,434,453	\$ 60,376
<b>Totals</b>	<b>\$ 2,494,829</b>	<b>\$ 2,434,453</b>	<b>\$ 60,376</b>

\* Building Budgets include costs for scoreboard replacement and associated electrical. The actual costs do not include these costs at this time as these will be re-bid and presented at a future meeting.

\*\* Construction Contingency in 2018 was only included on the work at CHS despite the fact that the athletic turf contract was awarded for all three high schools. The 2019 Construction Contingency amount (8%) was calculated on the work bid this year at Franklin HS and Stevenson HS plus the cost of the turf work for these sites (approximately \$1,300,000) which was previously awarded in 2018.

January 10, 2019

Philip Francis  
Director of Operations  
Livonia Public Schools  
15125 Farmington Road  
Livonia, MI 48154

RE: Livonia Public Schools  
Franklin & Stevenson High Schools - Athletic Improvements 2019  
Letter of Recommendation

Dear Mr. Francis,

Enclosed, for your review, is a tabulation sheet of the bids submitted on December 6, 2018 for the Livonia Public Schools – Franklin & Stevenson High Schools Athletic Improvements - 2019. Proposals were separated into six bid categories, which we received a total of twelve bids.

Post Bid Interviews were conducted with the apparent low bidders on December 20<sup>th</sup> and 21<sup>st</sup>, 2018. Our recommendations for award to the lowest responsible bidders are as follows:

**Proposal A1 & A2 Site Work:**

We recommend **Cortis Brothers Trucking and Excavating** of Marine City, Michigan to complete the work as identified in Proposal A1 Franklin Site Work and A2 Stevenson Site Work for the contract sum of **\$1,661,400.00**. The contract sum is based on the following breakdown:

Combined A1 & A2 Base Bid:	\$1,627,000.00
Alternate #2: install protective net posts	\$ 10,800.00
Alternate #4: remove/place asphalt under grandstands at Stevenson	\$ 23,600.00
<b>Total</b>	<b>\$1,661,400.00</b>

- The vendor recommended for award was not the “as-read” low bidder for this category. Reference checks and post bid interviews were conducted with both the apparent low bidder and second low bidder. The recommended vendor has previous experience working with the Livonia Public Schools and more positive feedback from their references.
- The Contract Sum is based on the acceptance of two alternates which include installation of a new protective netting system at the south end of the Stevenson HS stadium site and the removal & replacement of the asphalt paving under the Stevenson HS home grandstands. We feel these additions offer greater safety enhancements for the spectators.

**Proposal B1 & B2 Fencing:**

We recommend **American Fence** of Warren, Michigan to complete the work as identified in Proposal B1 Franklin Fencing and B2 Stevenson Fencing for the contract sum of **\$312,500.00**. The contract sum is based on the following breakdown:

Combined B1 & B2 Base Bid:	\$ 312,500.00
<b>Total</b>	<b>\$ 312,500.00</b>



**Proposal C Surfacing:**

We recommend **Goddard Coatings Company** of Pontiac, Michigan to complete the work as identified in Proposal C Surfacing for the contract sum of **\$183,900.00**. The contract sum is based on the following breakdown:

Base Bid:	\$ 183,900.00
<b>Total</b>	<b>\$ 183,900.00</b>

**Proposal D Scoreboards:**

Only one bid was received for this bid category. Due to the lack of bidders, we would not recommend award of this Bid Category. An additional Bid Package will be released at a later date to cover these scope items.

**The total amount recommended for award is as follows:**

<b>Cortis Brothers Trucking &amp; Excavating</b>	<b>\$ 1,661,400.00</b>
<b>American Fence</b>	<b>\$ 312,500.00</b>
<b>Goddard Coatings Company</b>	<b>\$ 183,900.00</b>
<b>Recommended Project Total</b>	<b>\$ 2,157,800.00</b>

Please advise our office of additional information that may be required from the recommended Contractor(s) so that we may secure on your behalf for presentation at the next Board of Education meeting.

If you have any questions or concerns pertaining to this information, please do not hesitate to contact our office.

Sincerely,

FORESITE DESIGN, INC.



Bruce Lemons, RLA



Michael Sims

BSL/mds

Encl : (6)



**Livonia Public Schools  
Franklin and Stevenson Athletic Improvements 2018**

Bids Due: 12/6/18 @ 2:00 P.M.

BIDDER:	BID SECURITY		IRAN ECONOMIC SANCTION		FAMILIAL DSCL.		ADDEN. No. 1		ADDEN. No. 2		Proposal A1 - Franklin Site Work	
	BB	CC	Y	N	Y	N	Y	N	Y	N	BASE BID	REMARKS
<b>Cortis Brothers</b>	BB	CC	Y	N	Y	N	Y	N	Y	N	<b>\$773,000.00</b>	
Braun Construction	BB	CC	Y	N	Y	N	Y	N	Y	N	\$2,499,000.00	Combo Bid A1, A2, B1, B2, C, D
	BB	CC	Y	N	Y	N	Y	N	Y	N		
	BB	CC	Y	N	Y	N	Y	N	Y	N		
	BB	CC	Y	N	Y	N	Y	N	Y	N		
	BB	CC	Y	N	Y	N	Y	N	Y	N		
	BB	CC	Y	N	Y	N	Y	N	Y	N		
	BB	CC	Y	N	Y	N	Y	N	Y	N		
	BB	CC	Y	N	Y	N	Y	N	Y	N		

\*\*Bold Indicates Apparent Low Bidder



**Livonia Public Schools  
Franklin and Stevenson Athletic Improvements 2018**

Bids Due: 12/6/18 @ 2:00 P.M.

BIDDER:	BID SECURITY		IRAN ECONOMIC SANCTION		FAMILIAL DSCL.		ADDEN. No. 1		ADDEN. No. 2		Proposal A2 - Stevenson Site Work		
	BB	CC	Y	N	Y	N	Y	N	Y	N	BASE BID	Alternate 4: Remove/replace asphalt under home grandstands	REMARKS
<b>Cortis Brothers</b>	BB	CC	Y	N	Y	N	Y	N	Y	N	<b>\$894,000.00</b>	<b>\$23,600.00</b>	<b>Combo A1 + A2 = \$1,627,000.00 Atl #2 = \$10,800.00</b>
TPK, Inc.	BB	CC	Y	N	Y	N	Y	N	Y	N	\$1,547,125.00	\$31,000.00	Combo A1 + A2
Braun Construction	BB	CC	Y	N	Y	N	Y	N	Y	N	\$2,499,000.00		Combo Bid A1, A2, B1, B2, C, D
	BB	CC	Y	N	Y	N	Y	N	Y	N			
	BB	CC	Y	N	Y	N	Y	N	Y	N			
	BB	CC	Y	N	Y	N	Y	N	Y	N			
	BB	CC	Y	N	Y	N	Y	N	Y	N			
	BB	CC	Y	N	Y	N	Y	N	Y	N			

\*\*Bold Indicates Apparent Low Bidder



**Livonia Public Schools  
Franklin and Stevenson Athletic Improvements 2018**

Bids Due: 12/6/18 @ 2:00 P.M.

BIDDER:	BID SECURITY		IRAN ECONOMIC SANCTION		FAMILIAL DSCL.		ADDEN. No. 1		ADDEN. No. 2		Proposal B1 - Franklin Fencing	
	BB	CC	Y	N	Y	N	Y	N	Y	N	BASE BID	REMARKS
American Fence	BB	CC	Y	N	Y	N	Y	N	Y	N	<b>\$169,392.00</b>	
TPK, Inc.	BB	CC	Y	N	Y	N	Y	N	Y	N	\$179,550.00	
Michigan Fence Outlet	BB	CC	Y	N	Y	N	Y	N	Y	N	\$180,000.00	
Future Fence	BB	CC	Y	N	Y	N	Y	N	Y	N		Not read. Missing documents.
Action Traffic	BB	CC	Y	N	Y	N	Y	N	Y	N		Not read. Bid arrived late.
	BB	CC	Y	N	Y	N	Y	N	Y	N		
	BB	CC	Y	N	Y	N	Y	N	Y	N		
	BB	CC	Y	N	Y	N	Y	N	Y	N		
	BB	CC	Y	N	Y	N	Y	N	Y	N		

\*\*Bold Indicates Apparent Low Bidder





**Livonia Public Schools  
Franklin and Stevenson Athletic Improvements 2018**

Bids Due: 12/6/18 @ 2:00 P.M.

BIDDER:	BID SECURITY		IRAN ECONOMIC SANCTION		FAMILIAL DSCL.		ADDEN. No. 1		ADDEN. No. 2		Proposal B2 - Stevenson Fencing		
	BB	CC	Y	N	Y	N	Y	N	Y	N	BASE BID	Alternate 2: Install Protective Netting and Posts	REMARKS
American Fence	BB	CC	Y	N	Y	N	Y	N	Y	N	<b>\$143,628.00</b>	<b>\$12,411.00</b>	Combo B1 + B2 = \$312,500.00
Michigan Fence Outlet	BB	CC	Y	N	Y	N	Y	N	Y	N	\$146,000.00	\$11,000.00	Combo B1 + B2 = \$336,000.00
Shamrock Fence	BB	CC	Y	N	Y	N	Y	N	Y	N	\$152,650.00	\$12,950.00	
TPK, Inc.	BB	CC	Y	N	Y	N	Y	N	Y	N	\$157,722.00	\$17,183.00	
	BB	CC	Y	N	Y	N	Y	N	Y	N			
	BB	CC	Y	N	Y	N	Y	N	Y	N			
	BB	CC	Y	N	Y	N	Y	N	Y	N			
	BB	CC	Y	N	Y	N	Y	N	Y	N			
	BB	CC	Y	N	Y	N	Y	N	Y	N			

\*\*Bold Indicates Apparent Low Bidder



**Livonia Public Schools  
Franklin and Stevenson Athletic Improvements 2018**

Bids Due: 12/6/18 @ 2:00 P.M.

BIDDER:	BID SECURITY		IRAN ECONOMIC SANCTION		FAMILIAL DSCL.		ADDEN. No. 1		ADDEN. No. 2		Proposal C - Surfacing	
	BB	CC	Y	N	Y	N	Y	N	Y	N	BASE BID	REMARKS
<b>Goddard Coatings</b>	BB	CC	Y	N	Y	N	Y	N	Y	N	<b>\$183,900.00</b>	
Star Trac Enterprise	BB	CC	Y	N	Y	N	Y	N	Y	N	\$204,000.00	
Beynon Sports Surfaces	BB	CC	Y	N	Y	N	Y	N	Y	N	\$214,430.00	
Dynamic Sports Construction	BB	CC	Y	N	Y	N	Y	N	Y	N	\$228,886.00	Bid received ontime. Missed reading publicly at opening
TPK, Inc.	BB	CC	Y	N	Y	N	Y	N	Y	N	\$283,670.00	
	BB	CC	Y	N	Y	N	Y	N	Y	N		
	BB	CC	Y	N	Y	N	Y	N	Y	N		
	BB	CC	Y	N	Y	N	Y	N	Y	N		
	BB	CC	Y	N	Y	N	Y	N	Y	N		

**\*\*Bold Indicates Apparent Low Bidder**

